

# Review of: "Stock Estimation Trial From Spatio-temporal Limited Data of Six Commercial Species in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon"

Matheus Silva<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Universidade Federal Rural de Pernambuco

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Title: I don't know if the title reflects what the paper is doing. To me, it is more similar to a 'stock assessment'.

Introduction: Some references in the introduction section are outdated. Additionally, the introduction does not highlight the problem effectively. What is possibly happening with the stocks? What is the stock structure? What species are involved? Who is fishing? When and how? What environmental factors are involved, and how do they affect fishing activity?

Methodology: The collection points (lat x lon) are not shown in the methodology. There is no map provided. The methods for estimating catchability linearly are outdated. Newer methods do not use these approaches. These linear relationships between CPUE and effort have numerous issues outlined by various authors.

Overall, it is good work but lacks a detailed explanation of what was done and uses outdated methods.