Exploding AI-Generated Deepfakes and Misinformation: A Threat to Global Concern in the 21st Century

Dr. Bharat Dhiman[1]

1 J.C. Bose University of Science & Technology, YMCA

Abstract

The term 'deepfake' was coined in 2018 by a Reddit user who created a Reddit forum dedicated to the creation and use of deep learning software for synthetically face-swapping female celebrities into pornographic videos. According to Sumsub's research in 2023, the top-5 identity fraud types in 2023 are AI-powered fraud, money muling networks, fake IDs, account takeovers, and forced verification. The country most attacked by deepfakes is Spain; the most forged document worldwide is the UAE passport, whereas Latin America is the region where fraud has increased in every country. On November 24, 2023, the Union Government of India issued an advisory to social media intermediaries to identify misinformation and deepfakes.

A deepfake refers to a specific kind of synthetic media where a person in an image or video is swapped with another person's likeness. AI-generated deepfakes have emerged as a complex and pervasive challenge in today's digital landscape, enabling the creation of remarkably convincing yet falsified multimedia content. This review paper examines the multifaceted landscape of deepfakes, encompassing their technological underpinnings, societal implications, detection methodologies, and ethical considerations.

The review aggregates and synthesizes a broad array of scholarly articles, studies, and reports to elucidate the diverse typologies of deepfakes, including face-swapping, voice cloning, and synthetic media, while delineating the intricate methodologies employed in their fabrication. This review culminates in an overview of future directions and recommendations, advocating for proactive measures to counter the escalating threat posed by AI-generated deepfakes.

Dr. **Pawan Singh**, and Dr. **Bharat Dhiman**

Associate Professor, Department of Communication & Media Technology, J.C. Bose University of Science and Technology, YMCA, Faridabad, Haryana, India

1. Introduction

Deepfakes' Significance in Spreading Misinformation

Deepfakes are highly realistic, AI-generated manipulations of audio, video, or images that convincingly depict events, situations, or individuals saying or doing things they never did. These creations are often so authentic-looking that they can mislead viewers into believing false information or fabricated scenarios [1][2].

Their significance in spreading misinformation arises from several factors:

Authenticity: Deepfakes appear genuine, making it challenging for people to discern between real and manipulated content. This authenticity allows false information to be disseminated widely without being easily recognized as fake.

Virality: In today's digital age, information spreads rapidly across various online platforms. Deepfakes, due to their high-quality and attention-grabbing nature, have the potential to go viral quickly, reaching a vast audience before their falseness can be identified.

Misrepresentation: Deepfakes can be used to misrepresent individuals, public figures, or events, altering perceptions and potentially damaging reputations or causing public unrest. By impersonating someone or altering their statements, deepfakes can deceive viewers and manipulate public opinion [1][3].

Targeted Disinformation: They can be employed to spread targeted disinformation, amplifying existing tensions or conflicts by creating seemingly authentic content that reinforces certain narratives or biases.

2. Evolution of AI Technology in Generating Realistic Fake Content

The evolution of AI technology in generating realistic fake content, particularly through deep learning algorithms, has seen significant advancements over the past decade. Here's an overview of this evolution:

Early Stages: Basic Generative Models: Initially, basic generative models like Restricted Boltzmann Machines (RBMs) and Variational Autoencoders (VAEs) were used to generate synthetic data. These models had limited success in creating realistic content due to constraints in modeling complex data distributions.

Introduction of Generative Adversarial Networks (GANs): The introduction of GANs by Ian Goodfellow and his team in 2014 marked a pivotal moment. GANs consist of two neural networks – a generator and a discriminator – engaged in a competitive process. The generator creates synthetic content while the discriminator learns to differentiate between real and fake data. This adversarial training enables GANs to produce more realistic and high-quality outputs across various domains, including images, videos, and text [4][5].

Progression to Deep Neural Networks: The proliferation of deep neural networks, particularly convolutional neural networks (CNNs) and recurrent neural networks (RNNs), further enhanced the capabilities of AI in generating realistic content. CNNs excel in image-related tasks, enabling the creation of visually convincing deepfakes, while RNNs are effective in generating sequential data like text or audio.

Technological Refinement and Accessibility: Over time, improvements in hardware capabilities and the availability of large datasets have facilitated more sophisticated training of AI models. Additionally, the open-source nature of many deep learning frameworks has allowed researchers and developers worldwide to contribute to the development of advanced algorithms, democratizing the creation of deepfake-generating tools [6].

Enhanced Realism and Multimodal Capabilities: Recent advancements in AI have led to the development of multimodal deepfakes, combining multiple modalities such as audio, video, and text to create more immersive and convincing fake content. This convergence of modalities enhances the realism of deepfakes, making them harder to detect.

Concerns and Ethical Implications: The evolution of AI technology in generating realistic fake content has raised significant concerns regarding the potential misuse of deepfakes for spreading disinformation, manipulating public opinion, and violating privacy and consent.

3. Societal Impact of Deepfakes and Associated Challenges

Erosion of Trust and Credibility: Deepfakes blur the line between truth and fiction, eroding trust in media, institutions, and even interpersonal relationships. When realistic but false content proliferates, it becomes increasingly challenging to discern authentic information from manipulated

content [3].

Manipulation of Information and Misinformation: Deepfakes can be used to manipulate public opinion, spread false narratives, and create confusion around crucial issues. They can be leveraged for political propaganda, discrediting individuals, or inciting unrest by portraying fabricated events or statements as real.

Privacy Concerns and Consent: Deepfakes raise significant privacy concerns as they can fabricate content that appears to feature individuals engaged in activities they never performed. This challenges the notion of consent and can lead to the misuse of personal data.

Potential for Exploitation and Blackmail: The creation of deepfakes poses the risk of exploitation, enabling malicious actors to create compromising content that could be used for extortion or blackmail.

Impact on Reputation and Authenticity: Deepfakes can damage the reputation and authenticity of individuals or organizations. By falsifying information or portraying individuals engaging in inappropriate behavior, deepfakes can tarnish reputations irreparably.

Challenges in Detection and Counteraction: The rapid advancement of deepfake technology makes it challenging to detect and counteract these manipulated media. Developing effective detection methods is crucial, but it's an ongoing race between the creation of fakes and the development of detection tools.

Legal and Ethical Dilemmas: Addressing the legal and ethical implications of deepfakes is complex. Existing laws might not adequately cover the creation and dissemination of deepfakes, raising questions about accountability and liability.

Impact on Journalism and Media Integrity: Deepfakes can undermine journalistic integrity, leading to a decline in public trust in media. It necessitates the implementation of stringent verification processes to maintain the credibility of information.

4. Union Government of India Advisory to Social Media

The Centre issued an advisory to the significant social media intermediaries to:

- Ensure that due diligence is exercised and reasonable efforts are made to identify misinformation and deepfakes, and in particular, information that violates the provisions of rules and regulations and/or user agreements, and
- Such cases are expeditiously actioned against, well within the timeframes stipulated under the IT Rules 2021, and
- Users are cautioned not to host such information/content/Deep Fakes, and
- Remove any such content when reported within 36 hours of such reporting, and
- Ensure expeditious action, well within the timeframes stipulated under the IT Rules 2021, and disable access to the content/information.

The intermediaries were reminded that any failure to act as per the relevant provisions of the IT Act and Rules would attract Rule 7 of the IT Rules, 2021, and could render the organization liable to losing the protection available under Section 79(1) of the Information Technology Act, 2000 [7].

5. Types of Deepfakes

Deepfakes can be categorized into various types:

Face Swapping Deepfakes: These involve swapping faces in videos or images, replacing the original face with another person's face. Deep learning models, especially Generative Adversarial Networks (GANs), are often used to achieve highly realistic face swaps.

Voice Cloning: This type of deepfake involves generating synthetic voice recordings that mimic someone else's voice. Neural network-based models can analyze and replicate a person's speech patterns and intonations, creating believable fake audio.

Text-based Deepfakes: These involve generating written content, such as articles, social media posts, or comments, that mimic the writing style

and content of a particular individual. Natural Language Processing (NLP) models can generate text that resembles a specific author's writing [8][9].

Synthetic Media and Audiovisual Manipulation: This type combines various elements to create entirely fabricated content, including videos or audio recordings of events that never occurred or conversations that never took place. These deepfakes involve creating completely fictional scenarios or altering existing media to convey false information.

Gesture and Behavior Manipulation: Some deepfakes focus on altering individuals' body movements, gestures, or behaviors in videos. These manipulations can change the meaning of the original content or create misleading impressions.

Multimodal Deepfakes: These combine multiple modalities (audio, video, text) to create more immersive and convincing fake content. By synchronizing different modalities, these deepfakes become harder to detect and more persuasive [10].

6. Impact of Deepfakes

The impact of deepfakes spans various domains and can profoundly affect individuals, society, and even global affairs. Here are some key impacts:

Undermining Trust and Reality Perception: Deepfakes blur the distinction between truth and falsity, eroding trust in visual and audio evidence. This can lead to skepticism towards authentic media, making it challenging to discern real from manipulated content.

Misinformation and Disinformation: Deepfakes are potent tools for spreading misinformation, manipulating narratives, and influencing public opinion. They can be used to fabricate events, statements, or behaviors, amplifying false information and sowing confusion.

Political and Social Consequences: Deepfakes can influence elections, political discourse, and social dynamics. They may affect the credibility of public figures, manipulate public perceptions of policies, and even incite social unrest by fabricating inflammatory content.

Privacy Violations and Personal Harm: Individuals can become victims of deepfakes, facing privacy breaches or reputational damage. Deepfakes can be used to create fake explicit content, defame individuals, or misrepresent their actions, leading to personal and emotional harm.

Impact on Journalism and Media Integrity: The spread of deepfakes challenges the integrity of journalism and media. Journalistic credibility may suffer if deepfakes are mistaken for authentic sources, undermining the role of media as reliable purveyors of information.

Economic and Business Repercussions: Businesses and industries reliant on trust and authenticity may suffer economic setbacks due to deepfake-related scandals. For instance, financial fraud or manipulated corporate communications can lead to financial losses and reputational damage.

Security Threats and National Security Concerns: Deepfakes pose security threats, including the potential for using fabricated content for cyberattacks, misinformation campaigns, or even in intelligence operations, undermining national security.

Challenges in Law Enforcement and Legal Proceedings: Deepfakes present challenges for law enforcement and legal proceedings. Authenticating evidence becomes harder, and distinguishing real from manipulated content in legal contexts poses significant hurdles.

7. Detection and Mitigation Techniques

Detection and mitigation of deepfakes pose significant challenges due to their increasing sophistication. Several approaches and techniques are being developed to address this issue. Here are some common methods:

Forensic Analysis: Experts use forensic techniques to analyze inconsistencies in deepfakes. This includes examining anomalies in facial movements, lighting, reflections, or inconsistencies in audiovisual elements that are not present in authentic media [1][11][12].

Digital Watermarking and Authentication: Some platforms use digital watermarks or cryptographic techniques to embed information into media

files during creation. These watermarks can help verify the authenticity of the content.

Machine Learning Algorithms: Counter AI algorithms are developed to detect anomalies in deepfake content. These algorithms leverage machine learning models trained on datasets of both real and synthetic media to identify patterns or artifacts specific to manipulated content.

Face and Voice Recognition Technology: Advanced face and voice recognition technologies are utilized to identify discrepancies between real and fake elements in audiovisual content. These technologies compare facial features or voice patterns against known authentic data.

Behavioral Analysis: Monitoring behavioral patterns, such as user engagement or interaction with content, can help detect anomalies associated with deepfake dissemination. Unusual behavioral patterns might signal the presence of manipulated content.

Blockchain and Decentralized Verification: Blockchain technology is explored to create immutable records or timestamps for media content, allowing users to verify the authenticity and origin of media files.

Collaborative Initiatives and Databases: Collaborative efforts involving researchers, tech companies, and governments aim to create comprehensive databases of deepfakes to train detection models and share knowledge and techniques for better detection.

Policy and Legislation: Governments and regulatory bodies are exploring policies and legislation to address deepfake dissemination, establishing legal frameworks for prosecuting individuals involved in the malicious creation and distribution of deepfakes.

8. Ethical and Legal Implications

The proliferation of deepfakes raises significant ethical and legal concerns, touching upon various aspects of society, privacy, and human rights. Here are some key ethical and legal implications:

Ethical Implications

Informed Consent and Privacy: Deepfakes often use individuals' likenesses without their consent, infringing on privacy rights. The creation and dissemination of deepfakes without explicit consent raise ethical questions about respecting individuals' autonomy over their image and identity [13][14].

Manipulation and Misrepresentation: Deepfakes can manipulate and misrepresent individuals, leading to reputational harm, emotional distress, or damage to personal and professional relationships. This raises ethical concerns about the impact on an individual's dignity and well-being.

Truth and Trust: Deepfakes blur the line between reality and fiction, eroding public trust in media and authentic information sources. Ethical considerations revolve around maintaining truthfulness, integrity, and transparency in communication and media representation.

Societal Impact: Deepfakes can exacerbate societal divisions, manipulate public opinion, and distort historical records. Ethical considerations involve the broader impact on society, democracy, and the dissemination of accurate information.

Legal Implications

Privacy Laws: Existing privacy laws might not adequately address the creation and distribution of deepfakes. Legislators are exploring amendments or new regulations to protect individuals' rights regarding their likeness and personal data.

Intellectual Property and Copyright: Deepfakes may infringe upon intellectual property rights by using copyrighted material or individuals' likenesses without permission. Legal frameworks need to adapt to address these violations and enforce copyright protections.

Defamation and Libel: Deepfakes can be used to defame or libel individuals by portraying them in false, damaging scenarios. Legal frameworks must delineate liabilities and address instances where deepfakes cause harm or damage reputations.

Criminal Use and Fraud: Deepfakes have the potential for criminal use, including financial fraud, identity theft, or creating malicious content. Laws must be updated to prosecute individuals engaged in illegal activities using deepfake technology.

Regulatory Approaches: Governments are considering regulatory approaches to mitigate the negative impacts of deepfakes, including labeling requirements for manipulated content or mandates for platforms to implement detection and removal protocols.

9. Public Perception and Awareness

Public perception and awareness regarding deepfakes are crucial in mitigating their impact and fostering resilience against misinformation. Here are some key aspects:

Understanding the Existence of Deepfakes: Educating the public about the existence and capabilities of deepfake technology is essential. Many people may not be aware of how easily digital media can be manipulated, leading them to believe false information.

Recognizing Signs of Manipulated Content: Teaching individuals to recognize signs of manipulated content, such as anomalies in facial expressions, unnatural movements, or inconsistencies in audiovisual elements, helps in discerning potential deepfakes.

Media Literacy and Critical Thinking: Promoting media literacy programs that teach critical thinking skills can empower individuals to question and verify the authenticity of information they encounter online. This includes understanding biases, fact-checking methods, and verifying sources [14][12].

Responsibility of Content Sharing: Encouraging responsible behavior in content sharing is crucial. Educating the public about the impact of sharing potentially false or misleading information can help prevent the inadvertent dissemination of deepfakes.

Role of Platforms and Technology Companies: Platforms and tech companies play a pivotal role in educating users about deepfakes and implementing measures to detect and label manipulated content. Providing tools for users to verify content authenticity can also aid in building awareness.

Media and Journalism's Role: Media outlets and journalists can contribute by reporting on deepfakes, educating their audience about the risks, and demonstrating how to critically evaluate information sources.

Community Engagement and Dialogue: Engaging communities in discussions about the implications of deepfakes fosters awareness and helps in understanding the potential consequences on society, democracy, and personal privacy.

Continuous Updates and Adaptation: Given the rapid evolution of deepfake technology, continuous updates in educational programs and awareness campaigns are necessary to keep the public informed about emerging threats and detection methods [10][13][3].

10. Future Directions and Recommendations

Future directions and recommendations concerning the landscape of deepfakes:

Technological Advancements: Invest in research and development of more sophisticated detection tools and algorithms capable of identifying increasingly realistic deepfakes. Explore AI-driven solutions that can adapt to evolving deepfake techniques.

Collaborative Efforts: Foster collaboration among tech companies, researchers, policymakers, and civil society to create standardized protocols for detecting and combating deepfakes. Encourage data sharing and joint initiatives to tackle the issue collectively [15].

Education and Awareness: Implement comprehensive educational programs in schools, workplaces, and communities to enhance media literacy, critical thinking, and digital literacy. Equip individuals with the skills to recognize and respond to deepfakes.

Regulatory Frameworks: Develop robust and adaptive legal frameworks that address the creation, distribution, and misuse of deepfakes. Consider amendments to privacy, defamation, and intellectual property laws to account for deepfake-related violations.

Platform Responsibility: Hold social media platforms and tech companies accountable for monitoring and regulating deepfake content on their platforms. Encourage the implementation of transparent policies and tools for users to report and verify content.

Ethical Guidelines: Establish ethical guidelines and industry standards for the responsible use of AI technology, including deepfake creation and dissemination. Promote ethical considerations in research, development, and deployment of AI systems.

Global Cooperation: Encourage international collaboration and cooperation to address the transnational nature of deepfake dissemination. Facilitate information sharing and best practices among countries to combat the global spread of misinformation.

Public-Private Partnerships: Foster partnerships between governments, academia, and the private sector to fund and support research initiatives aimed at understanding and countering the impact of deepfakes.

User Empowerment: Empower users with tools and resources to verify the authenticity of media content. Develop user-friendly verification tools and platforms that enable individuals to assess the credibility of information they encounter [16][15].

Continuous Monitoring and Adaptation: Stay vigilant and adaptive to emerging deepfake techniques. Continuously monitor and update strategies, technologies, and policies to stay ahead of evolving threats posed by manipulated media.

11. AI-Generated Deepfakes and Misinformation Do's and Don'ts

Do's

Awareness and Education: Educate yourself and others about the existence and potential impact of deepfakes and misinformation. Understanding their capabilities and implications is crucial.

Verification: Verify the authenticity of media content before sharing or believing it. Cross-reference information with reliable sources or fact-checking websites.

Critical Thinking: Develop critical thinking skills to detect inconsistencies or suspicious elements within content. Be cautious of sensational or out-of-context information.

Support Authentic Sources: Promote and trust content from reputable and verified sources. Encourage others to do the same, fostering a culture of credibility.

Technological Solutions: Support the development and implementation of AI tools that detect and counter deepfakes, aiding in the identification of manipulated content.

Don'ts

Sharing Unverified Content: Avoid sharing unverified information or media without confirming its authenticity. Sharing misinformation inadvertently contributes to its spread.

Blind Belief: Refrain from blindly believing content solely based on its emotional appeal or alignment with pre-existing beliefs. Verify before accepting.

Participation in Misinformation: Avoid engaging in the creation or propagation of misleading content. Participating in the dissemination of misinformation can have harmful consequences.

Overreliance on AI Tools: While AI tools can aid in detecting deepfakes, avoid complete reliance on technology alone. Combine technological solutions with critical human judgment.

Ignoring Ethical Considerations: Don't overlook the ethical implications of deepfakes. Consider the potential harm or consequences before creating or sharing any manipulated content.

Conclusion

The rise of AI-generated deepfakes and the proliferation of misinformation pose significant threats on a global scale in the 21st century. These sophisticated technologies have the potential to disrupt democratic processes, manipulate public opinion, and undermine trust in media and institutions. The threat posed by AI-generated deepfakes and misinformation demands immediate attention and concerted action. Effective solutions must encompass a combination of technological innovations, regulatory measures, ethical considerations, and public awareness campaigns. Safeguarding the integrity of information and fostering a climate of trust and accountability in the digital realm are imperative for a resilient and informed society in the 21st century.

———

Other References

- Cole, S. (2019). This Horrifying App Undresses a Photo of Any Woman with a Single Click. Vice. https://www.vice.com/en/article/kzm59x/deepnude-app-creates-fake-nudes-of-any-woman
- European Parliament Research Service. (2021). Tackling deepfakes in European policy. Retrieved from http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2021/690039/EPRS_STU(2021)690039_EN.pdf
- Dhiman, B. (2023). Evolving Media Coverage on Transgender Individuals: A Step towards Inclusivity. https://nbn-resolving.org/urn:nbn:de:0168-ssoar-86772-0
- Sumsub. (2023). Fraud Report 2023. Retrieved from https://sumsub.com/fraud-report-2023/
- Merriam-Webster. Deepfake. In Merriam-Webster.com dictionary. Retrieved March 25, 2022, from https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/deepfake
- Merriam-Webster. Misinformation. In Merriam-Webster.com dictionary. Retrieved April 25, 2022, from https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/misinformation
- TechTarget. Deepfake AI (deep fake) [Definition by Barney, N., Technology Writer & Wigmore, I.]. Retrieved from https://www.techtarget.com/whatis/definition/deepfake#:~:text=Deepfake%20AI%20is%20a%20type,person%20is%20swapped%20for%20another
- Business Today. (2023). What are the different types of deepfakes and how you can spot them? [Web post by Dixit, P.]. Retrieved from http://www.businesstoday.in/technology/news/story/what-are-the-different-types-of-deepfakes-and-how-you-can-spot-them-407118-2023-11-25

References

1. [a, b, c] *Agarwal, S., & Varshney, L. R. (2019). Limits of Deepfake Detection: A Robust Estimation Viewpoint. arXiv:1905.03493. https://arxiv.org/abs/1905.03493*
2. [^] *Merriam-Webster. Disinformation. In Merriam-Webster.com dictionary. Retrieved April 25, 2022, from https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/disinformation*
3. [a, b, c] *Hancock, J. T., & Bailenson, J. N. (2021). The Social Impact of Deepfakes. Cyberpsychology, Behavior, and Social Networking, 24(3).*

https://doi.org/10.1089/cyber.2021.29208.jth

4. ^*Ajder, H., Patrini, G., Cavalli, F., & Cullen, L. (2019). The State of Deepfakes: Landscape, Threats and Impact. Amsterdam: Deeptrace.*

5. ^*Gerlich, M., Elsayed, W., Sokolovskiy, K. (2023). Artificial Intelligence as a Toolset for Analysis of Public Opinion and Social Interaction in Marketing: Identification of Micro and Nano Influencers. Frontiers in Communication, 8(Media Governance and the Public Sphere), 2023. https://doi.org/10.3389/fcomm.2023.1075654*

6. ^*Atlantic Council's Digital Forensic Research Lab. (2021). #Stop the Steal: Timeline of Social Media and Extremist Activities Leading to 1/6 Insurrection. Just Security. https://www.justsecurity.org/74335/stop-the-steal-timeline-of-social-media-and-extremist-activities-leading-to-1-6-insurrection/*

7. ^*Indian Ministry of Electronics & IT (2023). Union Government issues advisory to social media intermediaries to identify misinformation and deepfakes. Press Information Bureau. https://pib.gov.in/PressReleaseIframePage.aspx?PRID=1975445*

8. ^*Atlantic Council's Digital Forensic Research Lab. 360/Digital Sherlocks. Retrieved November 5, 2021, from https://www.digitalsherlocks.org/360os-digitalsherlocks*

9. ^*https://www.livelaw.in/law-firms/law-firm-articles-/deepfakes-personal-data-artificial- intelligence-machine-learning-ministry-of-electronics-and-information-technology- information-technology-act-242916*

10. [a, b]*Barari, S., Lucas, C., & Munger, K. (2021). Political Deepfakes Are as Credible as Other Fake Media and (Sometimes) Real Media. OSF Preprints. https://osf.io/preprints/*

11. ^*Brown, N. I. (2020). Deepfakes and the Weaponization of Disinformation. Virginia Journal of Law and Technology, 23(1).*

12. [a, b]*https://www.mdpi.com/14248220/23/3/1708#:~:text=The%20detection%20of%20these% 20attacks, target%20defense%20(MTD)%20techniques*

13. [a, b]*Changsha Shenduronghe Network Technology. (2019). ZAO [Mobile app]. Zao App APK. Retrieved October 10, 2021, from https://zaodownload.com*

14. [a, b]*Chesney, B., & Citron, D. (2019). Deep Fakes: A Looming Challenge for Privacy, Democracy, and National Security. California Law Review, 107, 1753-1820.*

15. [a, b]*Whittaker, L., Mulcahy, R., Letheren, K., Kietzmann, J., & Russell-Bennett, R. (2023). Mapping the Deepfake Landscape for Innovation: A Multidisciplinary Systematic Review and Future Research Agenda. Technovation, 125, 102784. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.technovation.2023.102784*

16. ^*Clayton, K., Blair, S., Busam, J. A., Forstner, S., Glance, J., Green, G.,... & Wolff, W. (2020). Real Solutions for Fake News? Measuring the Effectiveness of General Warnings and Fact-Check Tags in Reducing Belief in False Stories on Social Media. Political Behavior, 42(2), 1073-1095. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11109-019-09533-0*