Review of: "Forecasting by Analogy: A Parallel between the Trend of Confirmed COVID-19 Deaths in the Winters of 2022/2023 and 2023/2024 in Italy"

Mario Coccia[1]

1 Italian National Research Council

Potential competing interests: NONE

Forecasting by Analogy: A Parallel between the Trend of Confirmed COVID-19 Deaths in the Winters of 2022/2023 and 2023/2024 in Italy

The topics of this paper are interesting. The structure and content must be revised, and results have to be better explained by the author.

The title has to be shorter and clearer.

The abstract has to clarify the goal, methods, and, considering that the data are old, authors have to show lessons learned, and show health and social implications for Italy to face next pandemics.

The introduction has to better clarify the research questions of this study and provide more theoretical background about these topics. Authors have to better describe the different sources of transmission dynamics of COVID-19 (e.g., climate, air pollution, density, etc.) and risk factors in Italy, which can accelerate the diffusion of this coronavirus in the environment; after that, the author can focus on the topics of this study to provide a correct analysis for fruitful discussion (See suggested readings that must be all read and used in the text).

Figure 1: insert the name of the variable on the y-axis.

The methods of this study are not clear. The section of Materials and Methods must be re-structured with the following three sections:

- Sample and data
- Measures of variables
- Data analysis procedure.

Authors have to avoid subheadings that create fragmentation and confusion. If necessary, they can use bullet points (same comments for the section of results and all sections).

Equations have to be written better with the tool of equations in Word.

Results.

Table 1 is long and can be split in two, one per page, indicating as title Table 1, Table 1 continued, etc. The results of changes can also be represented with bar graphs to be clear for readers.

Discussion.
First, authors have to synthesize the main results in a simple table to be clear for readers, to show a SWOT matrix, and then show what this study adds compared to other studies.

The conclusion is short and has to be extended. The conclusion has not to be a summary, but authors have to focus on the manifold limitations of this study and provide suggestions for environmental, health, crisis management, and social policy, as well as how nations, like Italy, can prevent, with good governance and tracing systems, next pandemics with vaccination and nonpharmaceutical measures of control.

Overall, then, the paper is interesting. Theoretical framework is weak, and some results create confusion… structure of the paper has to be improved; study design, discussion, and presentation of results have to be clarified using suggested comments.

Suggested readings of relevant papers to improve the manuscript:

Akan, A.P.; Coccia, M. 2023. Transmission of COVID-19 in cities with weather conditions of high air humidity: Lessons learned from the Turkish Black Sea region to face the next pandemic crisis, COVID, vol. 3, n. 11, 1648-1662, https://doi.org/ 10.3390/covid3110113

Coccia M. 2023. High potential of technology to face new respiratory viruses: Mechanical ventilation devices for effective healthcare in next pandemic emergencies, Technology in Society, vol. 73, May 2023, n. 102233, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techsoc.2023.102233

Bilal Kargı, Mario Coccia, Bekir Cihan Uçkaç 2023. How does the wealth level of nations affect their COVID-19 vaccination plans? Economics, Management and Sustainability. 8(2): 6-19. DOI: 10.14254/jems.2023.8-2.1

Bilal Kargı, Mario Coccia, Bekir Cihan Uçkaç 2023. The Relation Between Restriction Policies against Covid-19, Economic Growth, and Mortality Rate in Society. Migration Letters, Vol. 20, n. 5, pp. 218-231. DOI: https://doi.org/10.47059/ml.v20i5.3538

Benati I.,Coccia M. 2022. Effective Contact Tracing System Minimizes COVID-19 Related Infections and Deaths: Policy Lessons to Reduce the Impact of Future Pandemic Diseases. Journal of Public Administration and Governance, vol. 12, n. 3, pp. 19-33. DOI: https://doi.org/10.5296/jpag.v12i3.19834

Bai, X., Xu, M., Han, T., Yang, D. 2022. Quantifying the impact of pandemic lockdown policies on global port calls.Transportation Research Part A: Policy and Practice, 164, pp. 224–241

Bekir Cihan Uçkaç, Mario Coccia, Bilal KARGI 2023. Diffusion of COVID-19 in polluted regions: Main role of wind energy for sustainable health, International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology 10(3): 2755-2767, DOI:

10.15379/ijmst.v10i3.2286

Magazzino C., Mele M., Coccia M. 2022. A machine learning algorithm to analyze the effects of vaccination on COVID-19 mortality. Epidemiology and infection, 1–24. Advance online publication. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0950268822001418

Zhijun, C., Jian, G., Xia, Z., ...Haiqi, T., Yun, Z. 2023. COVID-19 epidemic prevention and control status and research progress of related technologies in Chinese ports. Proceedings of SPIE - The International Society for Optical Engineering, 12340, 123401N

Coccia M. 2023. Sources, diffusion and prediction in COVID-19 pandemic: lessons learned to face next health emergency[J]. AIMS Public Health, 2023, 10(1): 145-168. doi: 10.3934/publichealth.2023012

Bilal Kargı, Mario Coccia, Bekir Cihan Uçkaç 2023. Findings from the first wave of covid-19 on the different impacts of lockdown on public health and economic growth. International Journal of Economic Sciences. Vol. XII, No. 2 / 2023, pp. 21-39, DOI: 10.52950/ES.2023.12.2.002

Zhu Y., Xin J. 2020. Association between ambient temperature and COVID-19 infection in 122 cities from China, Science of the Total Environment, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.138201

Akan, A.P.; Coccia, M. 2022. Changes of Air Pollution between Countries Because of Lockdowns to Face COVID-19 Pandemic. Applied Sciences 12, no. 24: 12806. https://doi.org/10.3390/app122412806

Srivastava, A. 2021. COVID-19 and air pollution and meteorology-an intricate relationship: A review, Chemosphere, 263,128297

Coccia M. 2022. Preparedness of countries to face COVID-19 pandemic crisis: Strategic positioning and underlying structural factors to support strategies of prevention of pandemic threats, Environmental Research, Volume 203, n. 111678, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2021.111678.

Ardito L., Coccia M., Messeni Petruzzelli A. 2021. Technological exaptation and crisis management: Evidence from COVID-19 outbreaks. R&D Management, vol. 51, n. 4, pp. 381-392, https://doi.org/10.1111/radm.12455

Bashir, M.F., Bilal, B.M., Komal, B., 2020. Correlation between environmental pollution indicators and COVID-19 pandemic: A brief study in Californian context. Environ. Res. 109652.https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2020.109652

Coccia M. 2022. Optimal levels of vaccination to reduce COVID-19 infected individuals and deaths: A global analysis. Environmental Research, vol. 204, Part C, March 2022, Article number 112314, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2021.112314

Núñez-Delgado A., Bontempi E., Coccia M., Kumar M., Farkas K., Domingo, J. L. 2021. SARS-CoV-2 and other pathogenic microorganisms in the environment, Environmental Research, Volume 201, n. 111606, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2021.111606.

Benati I., Coccia M. 2022. Global analysis of timely COVID-19 vaccinations: Improving governance to reinforce response

policies for pandemic crises. International Journal of Health Governance. https://doi.org/10.1108/IJHG-07-2021-0072

Xu K, Cui K, Young L-H, Hsieh Y-K, Wang Y-F, Zhang J, et al. Impact of the COVID-19 Event on Air Quality in Central China. Aerosol and Air Quality Research 2020b; 20: 915-929.

Bontempi E., Coccia M., 2021. International trade as critical parameter of COVID-19 spread that outclasses demographic, economic, environmental, and pollution factors, Environmental Research, vol. 201, Article number 111514, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2021.111514

Coccia M. 2021. The impact of first and second waves of the COVID-19 pandemic: comparative analysis to support control measures to cope with negative effects of future infectious diseases in society. Environmental Research, vol. 197, June, n. 111099, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2021.111099

Rosario Denes, K.A., Mutz Yhan, S., Bernardes Patricia, C., Conte-Junior Carlos, A., 2020. Relationship between COVID-19 and weather: case study in a tropical country. Int. J. Hyg Environ. Health 229, 113587.

Coccia M. 2021. Comparative Critical Decisions in Management. In: Farazmand A. (eds), Global Encyclopedia of Public Administration, Public Policy, and Governance. Springer Nature, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-31816-5_3969-1

Askitas, N., Tatsiramos, K., Verheyden, B. 2021. Estimating worldwide effects of non-pharmaceutical interventions on COVID-19 incidence and population mobility patterns using a multiple-event study (Open Access)(2021) Scientific Reports, 11 (1), art. no. 1972.

Coccia M. (2020). Factors determining the diffusion of COVID-19 and suggested strategy to prevent future accelerated viral infectivity similar to COVID. The Science of the Total Environment, 729, 138474. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.138474

Shen, L., Zhao, T., Wang, H., (...), Zhu, Y., Shu, Z. 2021Importance of meteorology in air pollution events during the city lockdown for COVID-19 in Hubei Province, Central China Science of the Total Environment, 754,142227

Bontempi E., Coccia M., Vergalli S., Zanoletti A. 2021. Can commercial trade represent the main indicator of COVID-19 diffusion due to human-to-human interactions? A comparative analysis between Italy, France, and Spain, Environmental Research, vol. 201, Article number 111529, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2021.111529

Coccia M. 2022. COVID-19 pandemic over 2020 (with lockdowns) and 2021 (with vaccinations): similar effects on seasonality and environmental factors. Environmental Research, Volume 208, 15 May 2022, n. 112711. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2022.112711

Haque, S.E., Rahman, M. 2020. Association between temperature, humidity, and COVID-19 outbreaks in Bangladesh, Environmental Science and Policy, 114, pp. 253-255

Chowdhury T., Chowdhury H., Bontempi E., Coccia M., Masrur H., Sait S. M., Senjyu T. 2022. Are mega-events super

spreaders of infectious diseases similar to COVID-19? A look into Tokyo 2020 Olympics and Paralympics to improve preparedness of next international events. Environmental Science and Pollution Research, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-022-22660-2

Yuan, J., Li, M., Lv, G., Lu, Z.K. 2020. Monitoring transmissibility and mortality of COVID-19 in Europe ((2020) International Journal of Infectious Diseases, 95, pp. 311-315.

Coccia M. 2021. The effects of atmospheric stability with low wind speed and of air pollution on the accelerated transmission dynamics of COVID-19. Journal: International Journal of Environmental Studies, vol. 78, n. 1, pp. 1-27, https://doi.org/10.1080/00207233.2020.1802937

Sarkodie, S.A., Owusu, P.A. 2020. Impact of meteorological factors on COVID-19 pandemic: Evidence from top 20 countries with confirmed cases. Environmental Research, 191,110101

Flaxman, S., Mishra, S., Gandy, A., Unwin, H.J.T., Mellan, T.A., Coupland, H., Whittaker, C., (...), Bhatt, S. 2020. Estimating the effects of non-pharmaceutical interventions on COVID-19 in Europe (Open Access), (2020) Nature, 584 (7820), pp. 257-261.

Coccia M. 2020. How (Un)sustainable Environments are Related to the Diffusion of COVID-19: The Relation between Coronavirus Disease 2019, Air Pollution, Wind Resource and Energy. Sustainability 2020, 12, 9709; doi:10.3390/su12229709

Diao, Y., Kodera, S., Anzai, D., (...), Rashed, E.A., Hirata, A. 2021. Influence of population density, temperature, and absolute humidity on spread and decay durations of COVID-19: A comparative study of scenarios in China, England, Germany, and Japan, One Health, 12,100203

Coccia M. 2021. How do low wind speeds and high levels of air pollution support the spread of COVID-19? Atmospheric Pollution Research, vol. 12, n.1, pp. 437-445., https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apr.2020.10.002.

Rahimi, N.R., Fouladi-Fard, R., Aali, R., (...), Conti Gea, O., Fiore, M. 2021 Bidirectional association between COVID-19 and the environment: A systematic review Environmental Research, 194,110692

Coccia M. 2021. Pandemic Prevention: Lessons from COVID-19. Encyclopedia, vol. 1, n. 2, pp. 433-444. doi: 10.3390/encyclopedia1020036

Islam, N., Bukhari, Q., Jameel, Y., (...), Massaro, J.M., D'Agostino, R.B. 2021, COVID-19 and climatic factors: A global analysis. Environmental Research, 193,110355

Song, P., Han, H., Feng, H., (...), Li, X., Li, X. 2022High altitude Relieves transmission risks of COVID-19 through meteorological and environmental factors: Evidence from China, Environmental Research 212,113214

Coccia M. 2021. High health expenditures and low exposure of population to air pollution as critical factors that can reduce fatality rate in COVID-19 pandemic crisis: a global analysis. Environmental Research, vol. 199, Article number 111339,

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2021.111339

Li, H.-L., Yang, B.-Y., Wang, L.-J., (...), Ma, R.-F., Yang, X.-D. 2022. A meta-analysis result: Uneven influences of season, geo-spatial scale and latitude on relationship between meteorological factors and the COVID-19 transmission, Environmental Research 212,113297

Coccia M. 2023. Effects of strict containment policies on COVID-19 pandemic crisis: lessons to cope with next pandemic impacts. Environmental science and pollution research international, 30(1), 2020–2028. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-022-22024-w

Coccia M. 2022. COVID-19 Vaccination is not a Sufficient Public Policy to face Crisis Management of next Pandemic Threats. Public Organization Review, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11115-022-00661-6

Coccia M. 2022. Improving preparedness for next pandemics: Max level of COVID-19 vaccinations without social impositions to design effective health policy and avoid flawed democracies. Environmental Research, vol. 213, October 2022, n. 113566. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2022.113566