Review of: "Protection of Complex Network Systems From Targeted Attacks and Non-Target Lesions"

Alberto Costa¹

1 Swiss Federal Institute of Technology, Zurich

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This paper discusses the vulnerability of network systems by comparing the pros and cons of a "structural" approach and a "flow" approach.

Overall, the discussion has merit and focuses on a key and relevant challenge. At the same time, much of the discussion is qualitative, as there is not much theoretical or evidence-based support except a few pictures illustrating some examples. To make the case stronger, a quantitative analysis should be included. As an example, you can have a look at ref. [1], where an optimization algorithm is proposed and tested on both artificial and real networks, and the former is compared against topology-based methods.

I have some suggestions to improve the quality of the manuscript:

- Ask a native speaker to revise the whole text.

- I would amend the sentence at the beginning of both the Introduction and Conclusions with "has faced at least two global challenges" (for example, the Israel-Palestine war should be included).

- Define concepts from the beginning, e.g., non-targeted lesions.

- Do not use acronyms if not necessary (i.e., TCN).

- The notation \overline{1,N} should be explained.

[1] Costa, A., Ng, T. S., Kang, J., Wu, Z., & Su, B. (2022). Modelling fortification strategies for network resilience optimization: The case of immunization and mitigation. IISE Transactions, 56(4), 411–423.