

Review of: "[Commentary] The “Mental Health Crisis” and the Non-Being of the Mad"

Vicki Chartrand

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Your exploration of the historical roots of mental health treatment and its implications for marginalized communities is an ongoing concern. The paper clearly articulates the central argument that psychiatry has always been intertwined with biopolitical power and the politics of death.

The discussion of psychiatrists' historical role in justifying state violence is well-documented and insightful. The use of recent events, such as Jordan Neely's death, to illustrate the ongoing relevance of your arguments grounds your theoretical claims in real-world events, making the paper both accessible and impactful.

While your critique of the current system is thorough, the section on proposed solutions, particularly the abolition of psychiatry, could be expanded. Some sections discussing theoretical concepts (e.g., Lacan's symbolic order) are dense and may benefit from further clarification or examples to aid comprehension. For example, when discussing Lacan's symbolic order, include examples of how this operates in contemporary psychiatric practices.

Overall, your article presents a compelling argument that challenges traditional views on mental health and calls for a re-evaluation of how we perceive and treat individuals deemed "mad." Thank you for your important work in this area.